

RESULTS

Foxp3^{Cre}Cd28^{fl/fl} mice
 In order to determine the post-selection functions for CD28 in Foxp3⁺ Treg, we crossed the previously described Foxp3-CreYFP knockin mice¹⁶ (hereafter referred to as Foxp3^{Cre}) to mice carrying a conditional CD28 allele (Cd28^{fl/fl}) derived from EUCOMM embryonic stem cells.¹⁷ CD28 excision was monitored by surface staining for CD28, which validated Cre activity within Treg, with efficient deletion of CD28 within YFP⁺ Treg (Figures 1a and b). Unexpectedly, and in contrast to previous studies published using the Foxp3^{Cre} allele,^{15,16,18} we also observed the deletion of CD28 from conventional CD4⁺

T cells (Figures 1a and b). Deletion was observed in both naïve and, to a lesser extent, antigen-experienced conventional T cells, with considerable variation in the level of deletion (Figures 1b and c), indicative of low-level stochastic Cre activation in non-Tregs or a lineage precursor. Notably, the level of CD28 excision is higher in naïve T cells than in antigen-experienced CD62L^{low} T cells (Figure 1b), consistent with the function of CD28 in allowing transition between these activation states. Furthermore, we observed an indirect correlation between the level of non-specific CD28 excision and the frequency of CD4⁺CD25⁺ T cells (Figure 1c). As CD28-deficient T cells are poor IL-2 producers,^{11,19} this reduction in Treg numbers in mice with high levels of non-specific CD28 excision is likely due to impaired IL-2-mediated Treg homeostasis.¹⁴

Despite the promiscuous activity of Cre, which should be considered when using Foxp3^{Cre} mice, we assessed the function for CD28 in Treg after selection. Male Foxp3^{Cre}Cd28^{fl/fl} mice developed a lymphoproliferative disorder, including lymphadenopathy, mild splenomegaly, T-cell activation and lymphocytic organ infiltrations (Figures 2a and b and data not shown). In rare cases, mice presented with disease progression similar to scurfy mice (with fatal disease at 4 weeks of age). However, disease onset and severity were highly variable (Figures 2c and d), with other mice showing a milder phenotypic appearance, similar to the observations of Turka and colleagues.¹⁵ Correlation between the degree of T-cell activation and promiscuous Cd28 excision (Figure 2e) indicates that lineage-specific Treg excision resulted in severe disease, whereas promiscuous Cd28 excision resulted in the milder form of disease, probably due to the intrinsic defect in T-cell activation caused by the loss of CD28 (akin to the Cd28 knockout mouse).¹⁹

CD28 excision in Treg

Despite the variability in the disease caused by non-specific Cre activity in Foxp3^{Cre} Cd28^{fl/fl} mice, we were able to assess the impact of Cd28 excision in Treg by limiting analysis to female Foxp3^{Cre/wt}Cd28^{fl/fl} mice, where X chromosome inactivation restricts Cre activity to 50% of the hematopoietic compartment. In these mice, wild-type and Cd28-deleted Treg are generated in equal proportions and survive within the same microenvironment. In Foxp3^{Cre/wt}Cd28^{fl/fl} mice, CD28-deficient Treg registered a profound competitive disadvantage, with a relative decrease in number of CD28-deficient Treg cells from the default 50 to ~20% of the total Treg (Figure 3). These results demonstrate that post-Treg selection CD28 expression is critical for homeostasis, indicating a function either in lineage stability, proliferation or apoptosis.

As a serendipitous observation, we found that CD28-deficient Treg in female Foxp3^{Cre/wt}Cd28^{fl/fl} mice had reduced Foxp3 protein expression when compared with wild-type Treg in the same mice (Figure 4a). However, a similar reduction was observed also in Foxp3^{Cre}Cd28^{+/+} Treg when co-stained with congenically marked wild-type Treg (Figure 4b). Therefore, decreased Foxp3 expression was not caused by the loss of CD28 signalling and rather represents a mild hypomorphic feature of the Foxp3^{Cre} allele. Despite the false lead of depressed Foxp3 expression, the Foxp3 locus contains a CD28 response element in the conserved non-coding DNA sequence 3,²⁰ which still allowed for the possibility that CD28 directly modulates the stability of Foxp3 expression, and hence the stability of the Treg lineage. We therefore investigated whether the loss of CD28 signalling would result in reduced Treg lineage stability and whether ex-Foxp3⁺ cells, such as described by Miyao *et al.*,²¹ contributed to the above-described population of CD28-deficient non-Treg. To this end, Treg

Figure 1 Foxp3^{Cre} activity is not restricted to Foxp3⁺ Treg. (a, b) Lymph node CD4⁺ lymphocytes were analysed for the presence of CD28 cells among YFP⁺ Treg and YFP⁻ non-Treg in Foxp3^{Cre}Cd28^{fl/fl} males. (c) Representative flow cytometric analysis for CD28 CD4 T cells is shown. (d) The plot summarises three independent experiments with a total n=9 (Treg) and n=6 (CD62L⁺ and CD62L⁻ non-Treg); mean±s.e.m. (e) The graph depicts the inverse relationship between the presence of CD28 non-Treg and CD28⁺ Treg in Foxp3^{Cre/wt}Cd28^{fl/fl} females. Graph represents six independent experiments with a total n=

from *Foxp3^{Cre}CD28^{fl/fl}* and *Foxp3^{Cre}CD28^{+/+}* mice were purified and the methylation status of the Treg-specific demethylated region (TSDR) was analysed (Figure 4c). The data showed complete demethylation of the Treg-specific demethylated region in the presence and absence of CD28 indicative of stable Foxp3 expression.

CD28-sufficient Treg (Figures 5a and b). To exclude the possible influence of the hypomorphic *Foxp3^{Cre}* allele on Treg homeostasis, we analysed the proliferation status of *Foxp3^{Cre}Cd28^{+/+}* Treg and found

CD28. Here we addressed the peripheral requirement of CD28

- 23 Gogishvili T, Luhder F, Goebbels S, Beer-Hammer S, Pfeffer K, Hunig T. Cell-intrinsic and -extrinsic control of Treg-cell homeostasis and function revealed by induced CD28 deletion. *Eur J Immunol* 2013; **43**: 188–193.
- 24 Okkenhaug K, Wu L, Garza KM, La Rose J, Khoo W, Odermatt B et al. A point mutation in CD28 distinguishes proliferative signals from survival signals. *Nat Immunol* 2001; **2**: 325–332.
- 25 Wan YY, Flavell RA. Regulatory T-cell functions are subverted and converted owing to attenuated Foxp3 expression. *Nature* 2007; **445**: 766–770.
- 26 Williams LM, Rudensky AY. Maintenance of the Foxp3-dependent developmental program in mature regulatory T cells requires continued expression of Foxp3. *Nat Immunol* 2007; **8**: 277–284.
- 27 Kaji T, Ishige A, Hikida M, Taka J, Hijikata A, Kubo M et al. Distinct cellular pathways select germline-encoded and somatically mutated antibodies into immunological memory. *J Exp Med* 2012; **209**: 2079–2097.
- 28 Jeremiah NM, Liston A. Genetic tools for analysis of FoxP3+ regulatory T cells *in vivo*. *Methods Mol Biol* 2011; **707**: 105–118.
- 29 Floess S, Freyer J, Siewert C, Baron U, Olek S, Polansky E et al. Epigenetic control of